# JOSEPH B. FAY CO./NORWIN CONSTRUCTION COMPANY, A JOINT VENTURE

Joseph E. Linehan, Esquire Chad I. Michaelson, Esquire

VS.

# COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA PENNSYLVANIA TURNPIKE COMMISSION

Doreen McCall, Chief Counsel
John Cromer, Esquire
Stephie-Anna Ramaley, Esquire
Chad A. Wissinger, Esquire\*
Donald M. Lewinski, Esquire
Douglas C. LaSota, Esquire

#### \*December 24, 2008

Plaintiff filed Claim, proof of mailing and filing fee. Amount of Claim: \$7,188,843.92

## December 29, 2008

Board issued Acknowledgment letter and forwarded a copy of the Claim to Attorney General.

#### January 5, 2009

Attorney General filed Acknowledgement of Claim dated December 29, 2008. Receipt of same acknowledged on December 31, 2008.

# January 22, 2009

Defendant filed Preliminary Objections to Claimants Statement of Claim, Brief in Support and Proposed Order. [09A022309D]

#### January 22, 2009

Board forwarded letter to Plaintiff requesting response to Defendant's Preliminary Objections.

#### February 23, 2009

Plaintiff filed Response to Preliminary Objections and Brief in Opposition.

# March 24, 2009

Board rendered Opinion and Order. Order as follows: "AND NOW, this 24<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2009, it is hereby ORDERED and DECREED that the Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission's preliminary objections in the nature of demurrer are DENIED without prejudice. The Commission's preliminary objections for insufficient specificity pursuant to Pa.R.C.P. 1028(a)(3) are SUSTAINED. Claimant is GRANTED 30 days from the exit date of this Order to file an amended claim that will address its breach of contract claim(s) and damages with more specificity." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

#### March 30, 2009

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated March 24, 2009. Receipt of same acknowledged on March 26, 2009.

# March 30, 2009

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated March 24, 2009. Receipt of same acknowledged on March 26, 2009.

#### \*April 23, 2009

Plaintiff filed Amended Claim and Proof of Mailing. Amount of Claim: Unchanged.

# April 27, 2009

Board issued acknowledgment letter and forwarded copy of Amended Claim to Attorney General.

# May 6, 2009

Attorney General filed Acknowledgement of Amended Claim dated April 27, 2009. Receipt of same acknowledged on May 4, 2009.

#### May 26, 2009

Defendant filed Answer and New Matter to Claimant's Amended Statement of Claim.

# May 27, 2009

Board forwarded letter to Plaintiff requesting response to Defendant's New Matter.

#### June 4, 2009

Plaintiff filed Reply to New Matter.

# June 4, 2009

Board forwarded letter to parties directing parties to commence with discovery.

#### January 21, 2010

Plaintiff filed Motion to Compel Discovery.

#### January 21, 2010

Board forwarded letter to Defendant requesting response to Plaintiff's Motion to Compel.

# February 12, 2010

Defendant filed a letter advising the Board that it does not intend to contest Plaintiff's Motion to Compel and consents to the entry of an Order in form attached to Plaintiff's Motion.

#### February 18, 2010

Board rendered Order. Order as follows: "AND NOW, this 18<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2010, upon consideration of Claimant's Motion to Compel Discovery, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED and DECREED that the same be, and hereby is, GRANTED. Respondent shall respond in full to Claimant's First Set of Interrogatories and Requests for Production of Documents and produce any documents responsive thereto within fourteen (14) days of the date of this Order." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

## February 24, 2010

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated February 18, 2010. Receipt of same acknowledged on February 22, 2010.

#### March 8, 2010

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated February 18, 2010. Receipt of same acknowledged on March 4, 2010.

#### July 2, 2010

Plaintiff filed Second Motion to Compel Discovery and For Sanctions and Proposed Order.

# July 7, 2010

Board forwarded letter to Defendant requesting response to Plaintiff's Second Motion to Compel Discovery and For Sanctions.

## August 2, 2010

Defendant filed letter stating that they have made arrangements with Plaintiff's counsel to comply with Plaintiff's Second Motion to Compel Discovery within the prescribed time period.

#### August 4, 2010

Board rendered Order. Order as follows: "AND NOW, this 4<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2010, upon consideration of Claimant's Second Motion to Compel Discovery and for Sanctions and Respondent's letter of July 30, 2010, indicating it has now made arrangements to comply with Claimant's Second Motion to Compel Discovery but would not contest entry of an appropriate order, it is hereby ORDERED that the said Motion to Compel is hereby GRANTED without the imposition of sanctions. Respondent shall respond in full to Claimant's First Set of Interrogatories and Requests for Production of Documents within 14 days of the date of this Order. See Pa. R.C.P. 4019(a) and (j). This Order is without prejudice to Claimant's ability to seek appropriate sanctions in the event that Respondent fails to fully comply with this Order." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

#### August 9, 2010

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated August 4, 2010. Receipt of same acknowledged on August 5, 2010.

# August 13, 2010

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated August 4, 2010. Receipt of same acknowledged on August 11, 2010.

# September 17, 2010

Defendant filed Motion for Protective Order and Brief in Support.

#### September 17, 2010

Board forwarded letter to Plaintiff requesting response to Defendant's Motion.

# September 27, 2010

Plaintiff filed Third Motion to Compel Discovery and for Sanctions, Proposed Order. [06A101510]

#### September 27, 2010

Plaintiff filed Brief in Opposition to Motion for Protective Order.

# September 27, 2010

Board forwarded letter to Defendant requesting response to Plaintiff's Third Motion to Compel Discovery and for Sanctions.

#### October 15, 2010

Defendant filed Brief in Opposition to Claimant's Third Motion to Compel Discovery and for Sanctions.

#### October 20, 2010

Plaintiff filed Reply Brief in Support of Third Motion to Compel Discovery and for Sanctions.

#### November 17, 2010

Board rendered Opinion and Order. Order as follows: "AND NOW, this 17<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2010, after consideration of Fay/Norwin's Third Motion to Compel Discovery and for Sanctions and Respondent Commission's Motion for Protective Order, and the briefs in support thereof, it is hereby ORDERED and DECREED that Fay/Norwin's motion to compel answers to its Second Set of Interrogatories, Items 1, 2, 5 and 8 and a response to its Request for Production No. 5 is GRANTED. Complete responses to these items of discovery shall be made within 30 days of the exit date of this order. Fay/Norwin's motion to compel is also GRANTED with respect to Request No. 6 as set forth in this Opinion. Respondent's Motion for Protective Order is DENIED." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

#### November 22, 2010

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated November 17, 2010. Receipt of same acknowledged on November 19, 2010.

#### March 11, 2011

Plaintiff requested (4009.21 - to produce documents) subpoena(s) dated March 14, 2011 to Plaintiff.

#### March 14, 2011

Board forwarded (4009.21 - to produce documents) subpoenas(s) dated March 14, 2011 to Plaintiff.

# April 29, 2011

Plaintiff filed Fourth Motion to Compel Discovery and for Sanctions.

#### June 7, 2011

Plaintiff requested via telephone (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoena(s).

## June 7, 2011

Board forwarded (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum)subpoena(s) dated June 7, 2011 to Plaintiff.

#### June 9, 2011

Board forwarded letter to parties scheduling a status conference for 6/14/11.

#### June 14, 2011

Board Status conference held.

#### June 28, 2011

Plaintiff filed Protocol for Sampling Electronically-Stored Information executed by Plaintiff and Defendant.

#### June 28, 2011

Board forwarded letter to Plaintiff advising the parties to proceed on the agreed upon protocol for search of the PTC electronic records and to advise the Board whether or not Plaintiff will withdraw its Fourth Motion to Compel.

#### July 8, 2011

Plaintiff requested by telephone ten subpoenas 234.1 - to attend and testify.

# July 8, 2011

Board forwarded ten subpoenas 234.1 - to attend and testify to Plaintiff.

# August 24, 2011

Board rendered an Opinion and Order and rendered the following Order: "AND NOW, this  $24^{\rm th}$  day of August, 2011, it is hereby ORDERED and DECREED that the fourth motion to compel discovery filed by the Plaintiff on April 29, 2011, is hereby DENIED as MOOT." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

#### August 29, 2011

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated August 24, 2011. Receipt of same acknowledged August 26, 2011.

#### September 1, 2011

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated August 24, 2011. Receipt of same acknowledged August 30, 2011.

#### December 12, 2011

Plaintiff requested by telephone (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoenas.

#### December 13, 2011

Board forwarded (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoenas dated December 13, 2011 to Plaintiff.

# March 26, 2012

Plaintiff requested by telephone (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoenas.

#### March 27, 2012

Board forwarded (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoenas dated December 13, 2011 to Plaintiff.

#### June 20, 2012

Plaintiff requested by telephone (4009.21 - to produce documents) subpoena(s) dated June 21, 2012 to Defendant.

## June 21, 2011

Board forwarded (4009.21 - to produce documents) subpoenas(s) dated June 21, 2012 to Defendant.

## September 26, 2012

Plaintiff requested by telephone (4009.21 - to produce documents) and (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoenas dated September 26, 2012 to Plaintiff.

# September 26, 2012

Board forwarded (4009.21 - to produce documents) and 234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoenas dated September 26, 2012 to Plaintiff.

### October 3, 2012

Plaintiff filed Joint Status Report and request for entry of scheduling order with proposed hearing dates.

# October 10, 2012

The Board rendered the following Scheduling Order: "AND NOW, this 10<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2012, it is hereby **ORDERED** and **DECREED** as follows: All discovery, including exchange of any expert reports<sup>1</sup>, shall be completed by November 30, 2012; <sup>2</sup>The last day for filing pre-trial motions is December 21, 2012, 2013; <sup>2</sup>Motions for Summary Judgment and supporting Briefs shall be filed on or before December 21, 2012. Responses and Briefs in Opposition shall be filed on or before January 11, 2013; Oral argument shall be held via telephone on January 29, 2013 at 1:00 p.m.; Pre-trial statements of all parties conforming with BOC R.P. 501(b) shall be filed with the Board and served upon one another no later than February 22, 2013; A pre-trial conference is scheduled for Tuesday, February 26, 2013 at 1:00 p.m. Said conference shall be held at 200 North Third Street, Fulton Building, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor, Harrisburg, PA 17101; This matter is set for hearing beginning on Monday, April 8, 2013 and running through April 12, 2013, or as necessary. Said hearing shall be held at 200 North Third Street, Fulton Building, 6th Floor, Harrisburg, PA 17101. Unless otherwise noted, the first day of all hearings begins at 9:30 a.m., and subsequent hearing days begin at 9:00 a.m."

# October 17, 2012

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Scheduling Order dated October 10, 2012. Receipt of same acknowledged by Defendant October 15, 2012.

#### October 19, 2012

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Scheduling Order dated October 10, 2012. Receipt of same acknowledged by Plaintiff October 15, 2012.

#### December 7, 2012

Plaintiff filed Joint Motion to Amend Scheduling Order.

# December 7, 2012

Board rendered Order. Order as follows: "AND NOW, this 7<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2012, pursuant to a joint motion from the parties received by the Board on December 7, 2012, it is hereby ORDERED that: 1. The deadline for the exchange of expert reports set forth in the Board's Scheduling Order dated October 10, 2012 is hereby

modified as follows: a. Claimant's Expert Report shall be produced to Respondent on or before January 18, 2013; and b. Respondent's Expert Report shall be produced to Claimant on or before February 8, 2013 2. All other deadlines set forth in the Board's Scheduling Order dated October 10, 2012 remain in place. Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

#### December 13, 2012

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated December 7, 2012. Receipt of same acknowledged by December 11, 2012.

#### January 18, 2013

Defendant filed Praecipe for Substitution of Appearance removing Chad A. Wissinger, Esquire and Burn White, Esquire from the law firm of Burns, White & Hickton, LLC and entering Donald M. Lewinski, Esquire and Chad A. Wissinger, Esquire from the law firm of Marshall, Dennehey, Warner, Coleman & Goggin.

#### January 24, 2013

Board forwarded letter cancelling the oral argument scheduled for January 29, 2013 at 1:00 PM.

#### February 1, 2013

Board forwarded Notice of Settlement Conference.

## February 8, 2013

Defendant filed Motion to Strike Expert Report of Gregory C. Seigworth, CPA, Brief in Support and Proposed Order.

# February 8, 2013

Board forwarded letter to Defendant advising that the time for filing pre-trial motions has passed and accordingly, the Board will not be entertaining or addressing Defendant's Motion to Strike Expert Report of Gregory C. Seigworth at this time. The parties are instructed to come to the pre-trial conference scheduled for January 26, 2013, prepared to discuss this motion as well as any other outstanding matters.

#### February 11, 2013

Board forwarded letter to parties requesting a complete copy of their experts report(s) by no later than Tuesday, February 19, 2013.

# February 19, 2013

Plaintiff filed Expert Report of Gregory C. Seigworth, CPE.

# February 19, 2013

Defendant filed Expert Report of Shad E. Hoover, Ph.D., P.E.

# February 22, 2013

Defendant filed Pre-Trial Statement.

#### February 22, 2013

Plaintiff filed Pre-Trial Statement.

#### March 11, 2013

Plaintiff requested (Subpoena 234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoena(s) dated March 11, 2013 to Plaintiff.

#### March 12, 2013

Board forwarded (234.1 - to attend with duces tecum) subpoenas(s) dated March 12, 2013 to Plaintiff.

#### March 29, 2013

Defendant filed Subpoena directed to Errol S. Abdulla, P.E.

# March 29, 2013

Defendant filed Joint Stipulations and Exhibit List.

#### April 1, 2013

Defendant filed Subpoena directed to Donald G. Bouscher.

#### April 4, 2013

Defendant filed Summaries of Witnesses Identified In Pre-hearing Statement of the Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission.

# April 4, 2013

Amended Joint Stipulations and Exhibit List.

# April 5, 2013

Plaintiff filed copy of subpoena directed Matthew P. McTish, P.E.

#### April 8, 2013

Board hearing held in Board's Courtroom No. 1, 6th Floor, Fulton Bank Building, Harrisburg, Pa.

# April 9, 2013

Board hearing held in Board's Courtroom No. 1, 6th Floor, Fulton Bank Building, Harrisburg, Pa.

#### April 10, 2013

Board hearing held in Board's Courtroom No. 1, 6th Floor, Fulton Bank Building, Harrisburg, Pa.

#### April 11, 2013

Board hearing held in Board's Courtroom No. 1, 6th Floor, Fulton Bank Building, Harrisburg, Pa.

#### April 12, 2013

Board hearing held in Board's Courtroom No. 1, 6th Floor, Fulton Bank Building, Harrisburg, Pa.

#### April 12, 2013

Defendant requested in person one Subpoena 234.1. Board forwarded (in person) one Subpoena 234.1 to Defendant.

# April 12, 2013

Board forwarded letter (Via Fax) to parties requesting that bid documents for the "0-2 Project" be entered into evidence.

# April 15, 2013

Board hearing held in Board's Courtroom No. 1, 6th Floor, Fulton Bank Building, Harrisburg, Pa. COMPLETED

#### April 30, 2013

Testimony of hearing held April 8, 2013 filed. Copy forwarded to attorney for Defendant.

## May 1, 2013

Testimony of hearing held April 9, 2013 filed.

#### May 2, 2013

Testimony of hearing held April 10, 2013 filed.

# May 6, 2013

Testimony of hearing held April 11 & 12, 2013 filed.

#### May 7, 2013

Testimony of hearing held April 15, 2013 filed. Last Day

#### May 7, 2013

Board forwarded copy of testimony of hearing held April 9, 10, 11, 12 & 15, 2013 to attorney for Defendant.

#### May 17, 2013

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of testimony of hearing held April 8, 2013. Receipt of same acknowledged May 15, 2013.

#### May 17, 2013

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of testimony of hearing held April 9-12 & 15, 2013. Receipt of same acknowledged May 15, 2013.

## May 20, 2013

Plaintiff transmitted via facsimile a letter requesting an extension of time until May 31, 2013 in which to file its Findings of Facts, Conclusions of Law and Brief.

#### May 20, 2013

Board forwarded letter to Plaintiff granting extension of time request.

# May 22, 2013

Plaintiff filed via U.S. Mail a letter requesting an extension of time until May 31, 2013 in which to file its Findings of Facts, Conclusions of Law and Brief.

#### May 31, 2013

Plaintiff filed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Brief.

# June 17, 2013

Defendant filed letter requesting an extension of time until June 28, 2013 in which to file its Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Brief as well as proposed order.

#### June 18, 2013

Board forwarded letter to Defendant granting extension of time request.

## June 28, 2013

Defendant filed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Post-Hearing Brief.

# July 8, 2013

Plaintiff transmitted via facsimile a letter requesting an extension of time until July 19, 2013 in which to file its response to Defendant's post-hearing brief.

# July 9, 2013

Board forwarded letter to Plaintiff granting extension of time request.

# July 10, 2013

Plaintiff filed via U.S. Mail a letter requesting an extension of time until July 19, 2013 in which to file its response to Defendant's post-hearing brief.

# July 19, 2013

Plaintiff filed Reply to Defendant's Post-Hearing Brief.

## April 7, 2014

Defendant filed a Praecipe for Substitution of Appearance withdrawing the appearance of Chad A. Wissinger, Esquire and Donald M. Lewinski, Esquire and entering the appearance of Douglas C. LaSota, Esquire and the law firm of Marshall, Dennehey, Warner, Coleman & Goggin on behalf of Defendant.

# July 21, 2014

Board rendered Opinion and Order. Order as follows: "AND NOW, this 21<sup>st</sup> day of July, 2014, it is ORDERED and DECREED that judgment is entered against the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission and in favor of Joseph B. Fay Co./Norwin Construction Company, a Joint Venture, in the amount of \$5,966,683, comprised of the principal amount of \$4,300,446 plus prejudgment interest of \$1,666,237. Joseph B. Fay Co./Norwin Construction Company, a Joint Venture, is further awarded post-judgment interest at the legal rate of 6% per annum on the outstanding amount of this judgment until paid." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

#### July 28, 2014

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated July 21, 2014. Receipt of same acknowledged by July 24, 2014.

# July 31, 2014

Attorney General filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated July 21, 2014. Receipt of same acknowledged by July 29, 2014.

#### July 31, 2014

Defendant filed a request for transcription and proposed order.

#### July 31, 2014

Defendant filed Motions for Post-Trial Relief including Motion for Judgment N.O.V., Motion for New Trial, Motion for A New Trial on Damages and Three proposed orders.

#### August 4, 2014

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated July 21, 2014. Receipt of same acknowledged by July 25, 2014.

#### August 4, 2014

Board forwarded letter to Defendant with copy to Plaintiff regarding Defendant's request for copies of transcriptions.

#### August 6, 2014

Board rendered Opinion and Order. Order as follows: "AND NOW, this 6<sup>th</sup> day of August, 2014, it is ORDERED and DECREED that the Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission's motions for judgment n.o.v., new trial and new trial on damages are DENIED." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

# August 13, 2014

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated August 6, 2014. Receipt of same acknowledged by August 11, 2014.

## August 15, 2014

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated August 6, 2014. Receipt of same acknowledged by August 11, 2014.

# August 22, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of its Petition for Review as filed in Commonwealth Court.

# August 22, 2014

Commonwealth Court filed Notice of Filing Petition for Review. 1432 CD 2014

#### August 27, 2014

Board forwarded certified list comprising of the record to Commonwealth Court.

#### September 2, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of praecipe for appearance as filed in Commonwealth Court.

# September 2, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of Docketing Statement/Petition for Review and Amended Certificate of Service as filed in Commonwealth Court.

# September 5, 2014

Plaintiff filed a copy of Plaintiff's Cross-Petition for Review as filed in Commonwealth Court.

#### September 10, 2014

Commonwealth Court filed Notice of Filing Petition for Review. 1535 CD 2014

#### September 18, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of Pennsylvania Turnpike Commission's letter requesting a 30 day extension of time as filed in Commonwealth Court.

#### September 22, 2014

Plaintiff filed a copy of Docketing Statement and Statement of Issues as filed in Commonwealth Court.

#### September 24, 2014

Commonwealth Court Order filed. Order as follows: "NOW, September 22, 2014, the above-captioned cross-petitions for review are hereby consolidated. The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Turnpike Commission is designated petitioner under Pa. R.A.P. 2136. Consistent with the September 17, 2014, order at No. 1432 C.D. 2014, designated petitioner's brief (4 copies) and reproduced record (4 copies) shall be filed by November 6, 2014."

## October 14, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of its Statement of Contents of reproduced record and issues raised on appeal as filed in Commonwealth Court.

# October 24, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of its Motion for Second Request for Extension of Briefing Schedule as filed on Commonwealth Court.

# October 27, 2014

Plaintiff filed a copy of its Supplemental Designation of Contents of the Reproduced Record as filed in Commonwealth Court.

#### October 29, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of its letter attaching payment for its motion for second request for extension of briefing schedule as filed in Commonwealth Court.

#### December 1, 2014

Commonwealth Court filed Memorandum and Order. Order as follows: "NOW, this 24<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2014, after referral to mediation, the parties having reported on their efforts and progress toward finalizing an agreement to resolve the matters herein, it is hereby ORDERED that this case is stayed and the briefing schedule is suspended pending discontinuance or further Order. The parties shall file a joint status report with the Court no later than December 31, 2014, if the appeals have not been discontinued by that date."

#### December 22, 2014

Defendant filed a copy of Praecipe to Discontinue Appeal as filed in Commonwealth Court.

#### December 24, 2014

Plaintiff filed a copy of Praecipe to Discontinue Cross-Appeal as filed in Commonwealth Court.

# December 26, 2014

Commonwealth Court filed copy of Notice of Discontinuance of Action advising that matter has been marked "Discontinued."