

*(CONSOLIDATED INTO DOCKET NO. 3464)

Docket Number: 3762

LIMBACH COMPANY, LLC

~~Thomas O. Williams, Esquire~~
~~Theodore A. Adler, Esquire~~

VS.

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,
DEPARTMENT OF GENERAL SERVICES

~~Trent Hargrove, Chief Counsel~~
~~Michael C. Barre, Senior Counsel~~
~~Elizabeth O'Reilly, Assistant Counsel~~
~~David L. Nantiewicz, Assistant Chief Counsel~~

April 1, 2005

Plaintiff filed Claim, and proof of mailing. Amount of Claim: \$143,397.51+.

April 4, 2005

Board telephoned Plaintiff advising of filing deficiency: lacks additional copies and filing fee. Faxed notice of deficiency to Plaintiff.

April 5, 2005

Plaintiff filed additional copies of Claim and filing fee. ACCEPTED FOR FURTHER PROCESSING.

April 5, 2005

Board issued Acknowledgment letter and forwarded a copy of Claim to Attorney General.

April 12, 2005

Attorney General filed Acknowledgment of Claim form. Receipt of same acknowledged April 7, 2005.

May 2, 2005

Defendant filed Answer to Plaintiff's Statement of Claim.

May 12, 2005

Board issued letter to parties directing them to proceed with discovery.

June 21, 2005

Defendant filed Praecipe for Withdraw of Appearance of Elizabeth A. O'Reilly, Assistant Counsel.

June 21, 2005

Defendant filed Praecipe for Entry of Appearance of David L. Narkiewicz, Assistant Chief Counsel, on behalf of Defendant.

July 5, 2005

Defendant filed a letter requesting the Board to consolidate 18 cases before the Board regarding the Fayette SCI litigation.

July 18, 2005

Board rendered an Order. Order as follows: "**AND NOW**, this 18^h day of July, 2005, in order to expedite disposition of the multiple claims arising out of the construction of the Fayette State Correctional Institution, it is **ORDERED** that a status conference shall be held on July 27, 2005, at 200 North Third Street, Suite 700, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101 commencing at 2:00 p.m. Any party may participate by teleconference provided that a party wishing so to participate contacts the Board at least five (5) days prior to the conference and places the teleconference call as the Board directs." Copy forwarded to Plaintiff and Defendant.

July 20, 2005

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated July 18, 2005. Receipt of same acknowledged July 15, 2005.

July 25, 2005

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Order. Receipt of same acknowledged by attorney for Plaintiff July 21, 2005.

July 27, 2005

Board held status conference at 200 North Third Street, Suite 700, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101 commencing at 2:00 p.m.

August 3, 2005

Board forwarded letter to parties requesting comments regarding case management and scheduling.

August 16, 2005

Defendant filed letter with Defendant's comments regarding case management and scheduling.

August 17, 2005

Plaintiff filed (via fax) letter with Plaintiff's comments regarding case management and scheduling.

August 19, 2005

Plaintiff filed (via U.S. mail) letter with Plaintiff's comments regarding case management and scheduling.

November 16, 2005

Board rendered an Opinion and Order. Order as follows: **"AND NOW**, this 16th day of November, 2005, for the reasons stated above, the current consolidation of cases under Docket No. 3464 will stand as is, and the Board will not consolidate further the above-captioned cases either for the purpose of discovery or hearing, nor will it bifurcate hearings for the purpose of liability and damages. We will reserve the decision on whether or not to further consolidate one or more of these cases for the purpose of judgment for the reasons stated, and may reconsider same at a later date upon motion of one or more of the parties.

Finally, it is **ORDERED** and **DECREED** that the following unified discovery schedule and status conference is set for each of the above-captioned cases: Last day for plaintiffs to provide expert reports to defendant and to file same with the Board - June 30, 2006; Last day for defendant to provide its expert reports to plaintiffs and additional defendants and to file same with the Board - August 15, 2006; Last day for any/all expert rebuttal reports by any party to be exchanged and filed with the Board - September 15, 2006; Completion of all depositions and other discovery - October 15, 2006; Status conference for all cases in Board of Claims' Courtroom No. 1 beginning at 1:00 p.m. - October 25, 2006." Copy forwarded to all parties of record.

November 21, 2005

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated November 16, 2005. Receipt of same acknowledged November 18, 2005.

November 21, 2005

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated November 16, 2005. Receipt of same acknowledged November 17, 2005.

March 9, 2006

Defendant filed courtesy copy of letter addressed to all Plaintiff counsel in the Fayette County cases regarding the requests for electronic files.

May 2, 2006

Board rendered an Opinion and Order. Order as follows: "**AND NOW**, this 2nd day of May, 2006, it is **ORDERED** and **DECREED** that the following modified unified discovery schedule and status conference is set for each of the above-captioned cases: Last day for plaintiffs to provide expert reports to defendant and to file same with the Board - July 31, 2006; Last day for defendant to provide its expert reports to plaintiffs and additional defendants and to file same with the Board - September 15, 2006; Last day for any/all expert rebuttal reports by any party to be exchanged and filed with the Board - October 15, 2006; Completion of all depositions and other discovery - October 15, 2006; Status conference for all cases in Board of Claims' Courtroom No. 1 beginning at 1:00 p.m. - October 25, 2006." Copy forwarded to all parties of record.

May 9, 2006

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Opinion and Order dated May 2, 2006. Receipt of same acknowledged May 3, 2006.

July 21, 2006

Airport Industrial Park filed Motion for Additional Time to

Obtain, Serve and File Expert's Report.

July 25, 2006

Board rendered opinion and order. Order as follows: **"AND NOW,** this 25th day of July, 2006, it is **ORDERED** and **DECREED** that the following modified unified discovery schedule and status conference is set for each of the above-captioned cases: Last day for plaintiffs to provide expert reports to defendant and to file same with the Board October 15, 2006 Last day for defendant to provide its expert reports to plaintiffs and additional defendants and to file same with the Board December 15, 2006 Last day for any/all expert rebuttal reports by any party to be exchanged and filed with the Board January 15, 2007 Completion of all depositions and other discovery January 15, 2007 Status conference for all cases in Board of Claims' Courtroom No. 1 beginning at 10:00 a.m. January 25, 2007." Copy forwarded to plaintiff and defendant.

August 3, 2006

Board issued Opinion and Order. Order as follows: **"AND NOW,** this 3rd day of August, 2006, the motions for reconsideration and/or severance are **DENIED."** Copies forwarded to all parties of record.

October 12, 2006

Plaintiff filed Notice of Lay Opinion Pursuant to Pa. R.E. 701.

December 13, 2006

(ALL) Defendant filed (via fax) letter requesting the Board stay the Fayette county matters for sixty days.

December 14, 2006

Board rendered an Order. Order as follows: **"AND NOW,** this 14th day of December, 2006, it is **ORDERED** and **DECREED** that pursuant to Defendant's letter request dated December 13, 2006, an immediate stay is entered in all captioned cases as of today for sixty days. All current case deadlines are extended sixty days and the status conference will be rescheduled. The new

deadlines are as follows:

Last day for defendant to provide its expert reports to plaintiffs and additional defendants and to file same with the Board February 12, 2007; Last day for any/all expert rebuttal reports by any party to be exchanged and filed with the Board March 12, 2007; Completion of all depositions and other discovery March 12, 2007." Copy forwarded to all parties of record.

December 18, 2006

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated December 14, 2006. Receipt of same acknowledged December 15, 2006.

December 20, 2006

Defendant filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated December 14, 2006. Receipt of same acknowledged December 19, 2006.

December 20, 2006

Plaintiff filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated December 14, 2006. Receipt of same acknowledged December 14, 2006.

February 15, 2007

(ALL) Defendant filed letter requesting that the Board extend the discovery deadline until May 11, 2007.

February 16, 2007

Board rendered Amended Order. Order as follows: **"AND NOW**, this 16th day of February, 2007, it is **ORDERED** and **DECREED** that pursuant to letter requests dated February 12, 2007, from Amthor Steel and February 15, 2007, from DGS and Airport Industrial Park, all current case deadlines are extended as outlined below. This is the last discovery extension that will be granted by this Board. The final revised deadlines are as follows: Last

day for defendant to provide its expert reports to plaintiffs and additional defendants and to file same with the Board, March 12, 2007; Last day for any/all expert rebuttal reports by any party to be exchanged and filed with the Board, April 30, 2007; Completion of all depositions and other discovery, May 11, 2007; Additionally, counsel for the remaining parties are to advise the Board in writing of any days or times they cannot be available for a status conference during the week of June 18-22, 2007, within 10 days of the exit date of this Order." Copy forwarded to all parties of record.

February 20, 2007

Plaintiff filed letter advising that they join Amthor Steel's request for an extension of the discovery and rebuttal reports deadline.

March 12, 2007

Board rendered Order. Order as follows: "**AND NOW**, this 12th day of March, 2007, it is **ORDERED** and **DECREED** that a status conference to discuss a timetable for hearings and case management issues will be held at 200 North Third Street, Suite 700, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101 on June 20, 2007 at 1:00 p.m. Any party may participate by teleconference provided that a party wishing to do so contacts the Board for instructions at least seven days prior to the conference and places the teleconference call as the Board directs." Copy forwarded to all parties of record.

March 16, 2007

(ALL) Limbach filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated March 12, 2007. Receipt of same acknowledged March 15, 2007.

April 27, 2007

Airport filed (via fax) Emergency Motion to Allow Counsel for All Parties to Attend and Participate in Deposition of DGS's Expert, Or, Alternatively, to Quash Deposition.

April 30, 2007

Defendant filed (via fax) Response to Emergency Motion to Allow Counsel for All Parties to Attend and Participate in Deposition

of DGS's Expert, Or, Alternatively, to Quash Deposition.

April 30, 2007

Defendant filed (via U.S. mail) Response to Emergency Motion to Allow Counsel for All Parties to Attend and Participate in Deposition of DGS's Expert, Or, Alternatively, to Quash Deposition.

April 30, 2007

Airport filed (via U.S. mail) Emergency Motion to Allow Counsel for All Parties to Attend and Participate in Deposition of DGS's Expert, Or, Alternatively, to Quash Deposition.

April 30, 2007

Board rendered an Order. Order as follows: "**AND NOW**, this 30th day of April, 2007, the emergency motion of Airport Industrial Park, Inc., d/b/a PEC Contracting Engineers, to allow counsel for all parties to attend and participate in deposition of DGS's expert on the morning of April 30, 2007, or alternatively, to quash deposition, is hereby **DENIED**. The motion is not properly filed and is also **MOOT**. This Order is issued without prejudice to a

subsequent motion of any party seeking deposition of another's expert for cause shown pursuant to the Pennsylvania Rules of Civil Procedure." Copy forwarded to all parties of record.

May 4, 2007

(ALL) Limbach filed Acceptance of Service of Order dated April 30, 2007. Receipt of same acknowledged May 1, 2007.

May 11, 2007

Defendant filed letter advising parties are still in the process of negotiating a final settlement.

June 20, 2007

Board held status conference at 200 North Third Street, Suite 700, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101 commencing at 1:00 p.m.

June 28, 2007

(ALL) Board rendered Opinion and Order. Order as follows: "**AND NOW**, this 28th day of June, 2007, it is hereby **ORDERED** and **DECREED** that the Remaining Cases are hereby consolidated for all purposes, including discovery, hearing and decision, under Docket No. 3464; that the parties to the Remaining Cases are directed to observe the filing conventions set forth in this opinion; that counsel for those claims identified above as pending settlement are directed to file appropriate requests to close these cases or to inform the Board of the need to join said case to this consolidated matter within 45 days of the exit date of this order; and that the Remaining Cases shall proceed according to the following schedule:

1. All discovery shall be completed by October 31, 2007²; 2. The last day for filing pre-trial motions is November 30, 2007²; 3. Pre-trial statements of all parties shall be filed with the Board and served upon one another no later than December 31, 2007 (See BOC R.P. 501(b) and (c)); 4. A pre-trial conference will be held on January 17, 2008, at 1:00 p.m. Said conference shall be held at 200 North Third Street, Fulton Building, 7th Floor, Harrisburg, PA 17101; 5. Hearing dates for the consolidated case will be as follows: Part I March 3, 2008 - March 14, 2008 Part II March 24, 2008 - March 28, 2008 Part III A April 7, 2008 - April 18, 2008 Part III B April 28, 2008 - May 9, 2008 Part IV May 19, 2008 - May 23, 2008 Part V May 27, 2008 - May 30, 2008 Part VI June 9, 2008 - June 13, 2008 6. All testimony, documents, exhibits or other materials admitted into evidence during any portion of the hearings shall be considered as the evidential record for each and all of the claims remaining in this consolidated case. However, in order to maximize the efficiency of these hearings, the Board directs the parties to focus on the specific topics identified below during the following segments of the hearing: Part I PEC claims against DGS and DGS defense of same Part II Tomko claims against DGS and DGS defense of same Part III A&B DGS claims against PEC and PEC defense of same Part IV DGS claims against Penn Transportation and Penn Transportation's defense of same Part V Pro-Spec's claims against DGS and DGS defense of same Part VI Limbach's claims against DGS and DGS defense of same." Copy forwarded to all parties of record.

July 14, 2008

Plaintiff filed Praecipe to Settle, Discontinue and End.

July 17, 2008

Board rendered Order. Order as follows: " **AND NOW**, this 17th day of July, 2008, upon receipt of a praecipe executed by Theodore A. Adler, Esquire, on behalf of Plaintiff, Limbach Company, LLC, requesting that the Board mark its claims in the above-captioned matter settled, discontinued and ended, docketed with this Board under date of July 14, 2008, it is **ORDERED** and **DIRECTED** that the above-captioned matter be marked settled, discontinued and ended with prejudice regarding the claims of Limbach Company, LLC against DGS only. The action by DGS against Airport Industrial Park, Inc., d/b/a PEC Contracting Engineers will continue in the above docket."

Copy forwarded to all parties of record.
